

# Weekly Halacha Discussion

By Rabbi Doniel Neustadt

A weekly discussion of Halachic topics. For final rulings, consult your Rav.

## When Tisha B'Av Falls on Sunday

It is fairly uncommon for *Erev Tisha B'Av* to fall on a Shabbos. When it does, as it does this year [5768/2008], many of the distinctively sombre practices of *Erev Tisha B'Av* are modified or done away with so as not to infringe upon the *kavod* and *oneg* of Shabbos:

### On Shabbos:

- If one can occupy himself on Shabbos afternoon studying topics which pertain to *Tisha B'Av* or to mourning, he should do so.<sup>1</sup> If he cannot, he may study what he does ordinarily.<sup>2</sup> It is customary that *Pirkei Avos* is not studied on this Shabbos.<sup>3</sup>
- The usual *seudah hamafsekes* restrictions do not apply on Shabbos. At the last meal before the fast, which is *seudah shelishis* on Shabbos, one may eat meat and drink wine and consume whatever food he desires.<sup>4</sup> One should not however, state explicitly that he is eating in order to have strength for the fast.<sup>5</sup> Some *poskim* hold that it is forbidden to swallow a pill that makes it easier to fast since that constitutes preparing on Shabbos for a weekday.<sup>6</sup> Others, however, permit doing so.<sup>7</sup>
- Eating *seudah shelishis* with family members is permissible. Company however, should be avoided unless one usually has company for *seudah shelishis*.<sup>8</sup> *Birkas Hamazon* may be said with a *zimun*. *Zemiros* may be sung, even by one who does not always sing them.<sup>9</sup>
- Eating, drinking or washing any part of the body is permitted until sunset only.<sup>10</sup> If one recited *Birkas Hamazon* before sunset he may eat or drink until sunset.<sup>11</sup>
- One may sit on a chair until nightfall (*tzeis hakochavim*).<sup>12</sup>
- Since it is not proper to wear Shabbos clothes on *Tisha B'Av* it is recommended that one change clothes after nightfall but before *Ma'ariv*.<sup>13</sup> *Baruch hamavdil* should

be recited before changing into weekday clothes.<sup>14</sup>

- No preparations for *Tisha B'Av* may be made until Shabbos is over. *Tisha B'Av* shoes or *Kinos* (unless studied on Shabbos) may not be brought to shul until nightfall, even in an area with an *eiruv*.<sup>15</sup>

### Motzaei Shabbos:

- Shabbos shoes may not be removed until nightfall. The custom in many places<sup>16</sup> is to remove them after saying *Barechu* at *Ma'ariv*. Others remove their shoes after reciting *Baruch hamavdil* but before *Barechu*, provided that it is already nightfall.<sup>17</sup> This option is advisable for large groups of people (such as a camp) in order to avoid a long break between *Barechu* and *Ma'ariv*.<sup>18</sup>
- *Atah chonantanu* is said in *Shemoneh Esrei*. Women who do not recite *Ma'ariv* must remember to recite *Baruch hamavdil* at the conclusion of Shabbos.<sup>19</sup>
- After *Ma'ariv* but before the reading of *Eichah*, a candle<sup>20</sup> is lit and *Borei me'orei haeish* is recited. If one forgot or failed to do so, *Borei me'orei haeish* may be recited anytime throughout the night.<sup>21</sup>
- Customarily, *Borei me'orei haeish* is recited by one person for the entire congregation. It is proper, though, that all the listeners sit down while the blessing is recited.<sup>22</sup>
- Preferably, women should listen to *Borei me'orei haeish* recited by a man. If they cannot do so it is recommended that they recite their own blessing over a candle but they are not obligated to do so.<sup>23</sup>
- Some permit folding the *tallis* as on every *motzaei Shabbos*,<sup>24</sup> while others are stringent.<sup>25</sup>
- Dirty dishes from Shabbos should not be washed until

178); *Moadim u'Zemanim* 7:256; *Shevet ha-Levi* 7:77. At the very least, Shabbos clothes should not be worn during the reading of *Eichah*.

14 *Mishnah Berurah* 553:7.

15 *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 28:77.

16 Based on Rama 553:2 as explained in *Salmas Chayim* 1:86.

17 Rav S.Z. Auerbach (quoted in *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 28, note 179); *Yechaveh Daas* 5:38; *Moadim u'Zemanim* 7:256.

18 Rav M. Feinstein (oral ruling, quoted in *Halachos of the Three Weeks*, pg. 16).

19 *Mishnah Berurah* 556:2.

20 Some light a single candle while others hold two candles together.

21 *Mishnah Berurah* 556:1.

22 *Halichos Shlomo* 3:15, *Devar Halacha* 21, based on *Beur Halacha* 213:1, s.v. *al*.

23 See *Beur Halacha* 296:8, s.v. *lo*, *Igros Moshe*, C.M. 2:47-2, and *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 61 (note 69) and 62 (note 98) who debate whether or not women are obligated to recite a blessing over a candle on *Motzaei Shabbos*.

24 *Nitei Gavriel*, pg. 115.

25 *Luach Devar Yom b'Yomo*, quoting the Belzer Rav.

1 Chazon Ish quoted in *Orchos Rabbeinu* 2:136.

2 *Mishnah Berurah* 553:10. One may fulfil his obligation of *Shenayim Mikra v'Echad Targum*.

3 Rama 553:2.

4 O.C. 552:10.

5 *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 28:77

6 *Piskei Teshuvos* 553, note 13, quoting Rav S. Davlitsky. It is also questionable whether or not these pills are considered medicine which may not be taken on Shabbos.

7 See *Kol ha-Torah*, vol. 61, pg. 59 and vol. 64, pg. 298.

8 *Mishnah Berurah* 552:23.

9 *Igros Moshe*, O.C. 4:112-1.

10 *Mishnah Berurah* 552:24 and *Sha'ar ha-Tziyun* 22. See *Chayei Adam* 136:1 and *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 125:1 concerning washing.

11 *Sha'ar ha-Tziyun* 553:7.

12 *Salmas Chayim* 4:4-29, quoted in *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 62, note 88.

13 Chazon Ish (quoted in *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 28, note

# Weekly Halacha Discussion

By Rabbi Doniel Neustadt

A discussion of Halachic topics connected to the parashas of the week. For final rulings, consult your Rav.



Sunday after *chatzos*,<sup>26</sup> unless they will attract insects, etc.

## On Sunday:

- The rules of fasting for pregnant or nursing women or elderly or weak people are more lenient when *Tisha B'Av* falls on Shabbos and the fast is deferred until Sunday.<sup>27</sup> One should consult a rav concerning his specific situation.
- If a *bris milah* falls on Sunday the tenth of *Av*, most *poskim*<sup>28</sup> allow the father, *mohel*, and *sandek* to eat a *seudas mitzvah* after *Mincha Gedolah*.<sup>29</sup> A minority opinion rules that they should finish their fast.<sup>30</sup>
- Before breaking a fast because of illness<sup>31</sup> or to celebrate a *bris milah*<sup>32</sup> *Havdalah* should be recited. Many *poskim* hold that wine or grape juice may not be drunk and *Havdalah* should be recited on a *Shehakol* beverage such as beer, coffee or tea (with or without milk<sup>33</sup>).<sup>34</sup> Another option is to use wine or grape juice but have a minor (preferably between the ages of 6-9) drink the wine. Other *poskim* allow even an adult to drink the minimum amount<sup>35</sup> of wine or grape juice.<sup>36</sup>
- There are various views among the *poskim* concerning the recitation of *Havdalah* for women who are not fasting (due to illness, pregnancy, or nursing).<sup>37</sup> The

preferred option is that the woman's husband (or another man) recites *Havdalah*<sup>38</sup> and that she or a minor drink the beverage.<sup>39</sup> If that cannot be arranged, most *poskim* allow her to recite her own *Havdalah*.<sup>40</sup> If she cannot or will not there are *poskim* who permit her to eat without reciting *Havdalah*.<sup>41</sup>

- Most *poskim* hold that minors do not need to hear or recite *Havdalah* before eating.<sup>42</sup> A minority opinion requires them to do so.<sup>43</sup>

## On Sunday night:

- After the fast is over, one may not eat until *Havdalah* is recited. Women should hear *Havdalah* from their husbands or a neighbour.<sup>44</sup> If it is difficult for a woman to wait for *Havdalah*, she may drink before *Havdalah*. If drinking is not sufficient, some *poskim* allow her to eat without hearing *Havdalah* while others hold that she should make *Havdalah* herself.<sup>45</sup>
- *Havdalah* may be recited over wine or grape juice, and it need not be given to a minor to drink.<sup>46</sup>
- Only the blessings of *Borei peri hagafen* and *hamavdil* are recited. *Borei me'orei haeish* is not recited, even if one forgot to recite that blessing the previous night.<sup>47</sup>
- [Unlike this year 5768/2008] When Sunday is the tenth of *Av*, it is permitted to take a haircut, shave, do laundry, sew, bathe and recite *Shehecheyanu* immediately after the fast. Meat and wine (other than the wine from *Havdalah*) should not be consumed until the next morning.<sup>48</sup> Listening to music should be avoided until the next morning.<sup>49</sup> When Sunday is the ninth of *Av* [as it is this year 5768/2008], all of those activities are forbidden until *chatzos* on Monday.

trc.NET

26 Several *poskim* quoted in *Piskei Teshuvos* 554:21.  
27 *Beitur Halacha* 559:9, s.v. *v'eino*. See also *Halichos Shlomo* 3:16-2 and *Yechaveh Daas* 3:40.  
28 *Chayei Adam* 136:7; *Kitzur Shulchan Aruch* 125:8; *Mishnah Berurah* 559:37 and *Sha'ar ha-Tziyun* 39; *Igros Moshe, O.C.* 4:69-4; *Halichos Shlomo* 3:15, *Orchos Halacha*, note 60; *Yabia Omer* 1:34; *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 62:47.  
29 These people, then, should not receive an *aliyah* at *Mincha* (*Mishnah Berurah* 566:20, 21).  
30 *Aruch ha-Shulchan* 559:9, based on *Magen Avrohom*; *Kaf ha-Chayim* 559:74; *Chazon Ish* (quoted by Rav C. Kanievsky in *Tisha B'Av she'Chal b'Shabbos* 8, note 48).  
31 *Sha'arei Teshuvah* 556:1. If all that the sick person needs is a drink of water, *Havdalah* is not recited (*Shevet ha-Levi* 8:129).  
32 *Mishnah Berurah* 559:37.  
33 *Tzitz Eliezer* 14:42. Some *poskim* allow pure orange or apple juice as well.  
34 *Kaf ha-Chayim* 556:9; Rav M. Feinstein (oral ruling, quoted in *Halachos of the Three Weeks*, pg. 19); *Minchas Yitzchak* 8:30; *Halichos Shlomo* 3:16-8; *Shevet ha-Levi* 7:77.  
35 A cheek full, approximately 45 ml – 1.6 US fl. oz. However, since *al hagafen* cannot be recited over this amount, this should be followed by eating cake, etc. and the words *al hagafen v'al peri hagafen* can be inserted in the *Al hamichyah*.  
36 *Chazon Ish* (quoted by Rav C. Kanievsky, *Mevakshei Torah, Sivan* 5753); Rav Y.Z. Soloveitchik (quoted in *Peninei Rabbeinu Hagriz*, pg. 521 and *Mevakshei Torah, Sivan* 5753); Rav Y. Y. Kanievsky (*Orchos Rabbeinu* 2:145); *Az Nidberu* 11:48.  
37 The issue:  
1) Women, generally, do not recite their own *Havdalah* since some *Rishonim* exempt them from *Havdalah* altogether;

2) Even men are not required by all *poskim* to recite *Havdalah* before eating on a Sunday *Tisha B'Av*.  
38 The husband then does not repeat the *Havdalah* for himself once the fast is over (*Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 62:48).  
39 *Halichos Shlomo* 3:16, *Orchos Halacha*, note 39.  
40 *Shevet ha-Levi* 8:129; *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 62:48; *Az Nidberu* 11:48; *Moadim u'Zemanim* 7:255.  
41 *Kinyan Torah* 5:51; *Shraga ha-Meir* 1:59; *Nitei Gavriel*, pg. 164.  
42 Rav Y. Y. Kanievsky (*Orchos Rabbeinu* 2:145); *Halichos Shlomo* 3:16, *Devar Halacha* 13; Rav Y.S. Elyashiv (quoted in *Rivevos Efrayim* 3:371); *Shemiras Shabbos K'hilchasah* 62:45; *Moadim u'Zemanim* 7:255; *Chanoch l'Na'ar* 28:10.  
43 *Maharil Diskin* 2:5-72; *Divrei Yatziv* 2:243; *Shevet ha-Levi* 7:77. There are conflicting reports as to the opinion of Rav M. Feinstein; see *Children in Halacha*, pg. 190.  
44 *Minchas Yitzchak* 8:51.  
45 See *Piskei Teshuvos* 556:2 for the various views.  
46 *Mishnah Berurah* 556:3.  
47 *Mishnah Berurah* 556:4.  
48 *Rama* 558:1.  
49 See *Sha'ar ha-Tziyun* 558:4, who is lenient about music for a *seudas mitzvah*.